



COMPETENCY MANAGEMENT PROGRAM FOR EDUKASYONG PANTAHANAN AT PANGKABUHAYAN (EPP) TEACHERS

JOVELYN F. CASULLA

Institution : Institute of Graduate and Professional Studies
Lyceum-Northwestern University
Dagupan City

Abstract : This research study aimed to assess the instructional supervisory skills of public secondary school heads in the Third This study loThe study assessed the technical skills of Edukasyong Pantahanan at Pangkabuhayan (EPP) teachers in public elementary schools of Schools Division Office I Pangasinan relative to their instructional performance in accordance with prescribed regulations. It determined the teachers' profile and their extent of manifestation of competencies along the areas of EPP. It also measured the teachers' level of competencies in content knowledge, methods, classroom management, ICT integration and evaluation. The descriptive design was used, with a research-made questionnaire as main data gathering instrument. Interviews and FGD's were conducted to substantiate key findings. Results revealed that teachers greatly manifest competencies in Home Economics and Industrial Arts, while they moderately manifest competencies in Agriculture and ICT. Teachers are generally very competent in terms of knowledge content, use of strategies and methods, classroom management, integration of ICT, and assessment and evaluation. Further, teachers need to strengthen their skills in applying a range of teaching strategies. They also need to attend more EPP-focused training and improve their ICT skills for lesson integration. As a result of the findings, a competency management program was developed to enhance the level of competencies of EPP teachers.

Keywords: technical skills, Edukasyong Pantahanan at Pangkabuhayan, competencies

INTRODUCTION

In any professional field, the basic pre-requisite for recruitment and promotion is competence, or the combination of basic skills, knowledge, and attitude of an individual. It involves the acquired knowledge, exerted effort, and professional experience all of which facilitate task completion. (Nijveldt, at al., 2001). Main and Hammond (2008) contend that competency also encompasses personal characteristics which, when owned and used, lead to completion of task or position. In school, competencies strengthen one another and start with the basic then move on to the advanced levels as learning progresses. (Council on Education for Public Health, 2006).

In the professional world of teaching, a teacher's competency comprises of personal, professional, and social aspects. This includes teaching, as an expert in the subject and in theories related to teaching and learning, as well as in managing learning processes and adapting oneself in the community (Klassen & Chiu, 2010). Teacher education institutions in many parts of the world explore ways of using competencies to assist the professional development of teachers without undermining the quality of instruction. Pre-service education programs that teachers usually undergo do not guarantee competence that would meet the demands of development. Thus, it becomes imperative that schools continue to examine and reinforce the initial and ongoing formation of teachers to make them more effective and competent.

Educators, play a great role in training and preparing the youth for the country to become competitive in the 21 centuries. They are considered the most important resources in an educational system. They bring organization to life, make it work, and give its distinctive character. The quality of an educational institution to a great extent depends on the excellence and competency of its faculty. Hence, teacher competency should be ensured, especially in subject areas that have a direct relevance and impact to society.

Edukasyong Pantahanan at Pangkabuhayan (EPP) is one of the subjects in the Enhanced Basic Education Curriculum of the Department of Education (DepEd). This subject teaches competencies to students that are very useful in everyday living. To highlight its worth in the K-12 Basic Education Program (BEP), the DepEd has formed a Technical Vocational unit in the Bureau of Secondary Education. For them, this unit needs strengthening as one of the three key strands that will prepare high school graduates by arming them with skills for employment.

The main goal of teaching technical and vocational education in the K to 12 Basic Education Program is to prepare students for the world of work through the acquisition of theoretical and practical skills. The students are expected to be equipped with the necessary knowledge within their trades in order to face the challenges of the labor market.

Education is a must for individual considering the problems, trends and innovations in educational system. (Padolina, 2004). Taking into consideration the global environment, people view education not only a way of developing people's skills but also a way of preparing our students to be globally competitive. If the schools were able to produce quality graduates it will redound on the quality of work they will provide in their respective workplace. The academic track provides for a continuum toward preparation for higher tertiary education and skills development qualifications for National Certificates I and II (NC I and NC II). While public private partnerships have long been in existence, industry- academe linkages and partnership are essentially weak if not non-existent in many of our academic institutions and need to be strengthened and made part of local socio-economic development.

The development of the nation largely depends on education. The quality of education will also be determined on the performances of teachers in the school. Improving teacher quality is considered as an essential reform to improve student attainment and ensure it has a world class system of education (Australian Institute for Teaching and School Leadership), 2011. Becoming a teacher entails finishing a degree and passing the licensure exam for teachers. Nonetheless, the degree and certificates are not guarantee for teaching effectiveness. Lederman & Niess (2001), point out certain factors that affect teaching effectiveness such as personality traits, pedagogical knowledge, behavior towards student learning, mastery of competencies, professional decision-making and the pedagogical content knowledge. This is what defines a competent teacher who can develop the 21st century skills and improve students' learning.

Teaching in the elementary can be a challenging task for teachers as it greatly demands the strong competencies to be able to develop the knowledge and skills of the pupils indicated in the curriculum. The improvement is mandated under Republic Act 10533 otherwise known as the Enhanced Basic Education Act which stipulates that the program should meet the demand for quality teachers and school leaders. In response to this mandate, the curriculum for EPP in the elementary was enhanced in terms of specific skills and knowledge that the elementary pupils must develop in order to meet the requirements for further learning. The subject being taught in grade 4 encompasses the field of ICT & Entrepreneurship, Agriculture, Home Economics, and Industrial Arts. It is geared toward the development of technological proficiency and is anchored on knowledge and information, entrepreneurial concepts, process and delivery, work and values. These teachers may have the limited opportunity to undergo skills training by their respective schools due to insufficient MOOE. Gempes et al. (2018), revealed in the study that DepEd teachers experienced inequity in attending seminars and trainings. It was observed that only the chosen few could avail of it. Although, the Technical Education Skills Development Authority in the province provides free training, elementary teachers cannot actively participate due to their busy class schedule and other school-related functions. Corollary to this, teaching of EPP may not be effective as the curriculum requires developed competencies of teachers to be able to deliver quality instruction. Furthermore, being generalists, teachers may not possess the specific skills and knowledge necessary to facilitate learning of the learners.

In any professional field, the basic pre-requisite for recruitment and promotion is competence, or the combination of basic skills, knowledge, and attitude of an individual. It involves the acquired knowledge, exerted effort, and professional experience all of which facilitate task completion. (Nijveldt, et al., 2001). Main and Hammond (2008) contend that competency also encompasses personal characteristics which, when owned and used, lead to completion of task or position. In school, competencies strengthen one another and start with the basic then move on to the advanced levels as learning progresses. (Council on Education for Public Health, 2006).

In the professional world of teaching, a teacher's competency comprises of personal, professional, and social aspects. This includes teaching, as an expert in the subject and in theories related to teaching and learning, as well as in managing learning processes and adapting oneself in the community (Klassen & Chiu, 2010). Teacher education institutions in many parts of the world explore ways of using competencies to assist the professional development of teachers without undermining the quality of instruction. Pre-service education programs that teachers usually undergo do not guarantee competence that would meet the demands of development. Thus, it becomes imperative that schools continue to examine and reinforce the initial and ongoing formation of teachers to make them more effective and competent.

The school is a very important institution which can provide career pathways for students. Teaching Edukasyong Pantahanan at Pangkabuhayan would provide practical knowledge and skills of vocational and technological efficiency and problem solving in daily life.

Edukasyong Pantahanan at Pangkabuhayan is a subject area under the Basic Education Curriculum which equips learners with knowledge and information, skills and process, right work values and life skills in the field of Home Economics, Carpentry, Entrepreneurship, Agriculture, Industrial Arts, and Computer Education. The acquisition of basic vocational knowledge, skills and attitudes to facilitate occupational efficiency requires skill-oriented teaching and learning activities. Thus, there is a need for the realistic and experiential learning aided by the right and adequate tools, and instructional materials for instruction is necessary.

Educators, play a great role in training and preparing the youth for the country to become competitive in the 21st centuries. They are considered the most important resources in an educational system. They bring organization to life, make it work, and give its distinctive character. The quality of an educational institution to a great extent depends on the excellence and competency of its faculty. Hence, teacher competency should be ensured, especially in subject areas that have a direct relevance and impact to society.

STATEMENT OF THE PROBLEM

This study assessed the technical skills of Edukasyong Pantahanan at Pangkabuhayan (EPP) teachers in Anda District, Schools Division Office I Pangasinan relative to their instructional performance in accordance with the prescribed regulations.

Specifically, it sought to answer the following sub-problems:

1. What are the personal and professional characteristics of EPP teachers in terms of:
 - 1.1 age;
 - 1.2 sex;
 - 1.3 number of years teaching;

- 1.4 highest educational attainment;
- 1.5 seminars and training attended and;
- 1.6 number of completed and presented researches
2. What is the level of manifestation of competencies along the four areas of EPP, namely:
 - 2.1 Home Economics;
 - 2.2 Industrial Arts;
 - 2.3 Information and Communications Technology, and;
 - 2.4 Agriculture
3. What is the level of competencies of EPP teachers in terms of:
 - 3.1 knowledge of content within and across curriculum teaching areas;
 - 3.2 strategies and methods;
 - 3.3 classroom management;
 - 3.4 integration of ICT and;
 - 3.5 assessment and evaluation.
4. Is there a significant relationship between the level of competencies of TLE teachers and their profile variables?
5. What are the competency needs of EPP teachers?
6. Based on the findings, what competency management program for EPP teachers can be proposed?

METHODOLOGY

This chapter presents the research design, sources of data, instrumentation and data collection and the tools for data analysis.

Research Design

The study used the descriptive method of research as it aimed to assess the level of competencies of EPP teachers. According to Frankel (2010), descriptive research involves looking into the present situation and describing it using quantitative measurements. This method involves collection of data as an attempt to examine the situation in order to establish the norm and to predict what will happen under same circumstances.

This research design was selected as it can be used to assess the characteristics of individuals or groups of physical environments such as teachers of particular schools. The study used this method in gathering data and information towards the development of a competency management program for EPP, geared of enhancing the instructional performance of EPP teachers.

A researcher-constructed questionnaire was utilized in this study to gather important data relative to the study. To substantiate the data gathered, the researcher also conducted interviews and focus group discussion.

Sources of Data

The respondents of the study were EPP teachers from selected elementary schools in Anda District, Schools Division Office I Pangasinan. These respondents were chosen through stratified random sampling. Moreover, to arrive at the actual number of respondents, the sample size determination formula was used at 0.5 level of significance. In order to validate the instrument of this study, a pilot run was conducted involving 20 teachers who are not part of the actual study.

Instrumentation and Data Collection

The study utilized a research-made questionnaire, as main gathering tool. Interviews and focused group discussion (FGD) were done to substantiate relevant findings. Unstructured questions for the interview were used to guide the researcher in getting additional information while the FGD agenda was used to provide direction during the FGD.

Questionnaire: The survey questionnaire was developed in fidelity to the specific objectives stated as reasons for constructing the study. It was based on the concepts and related studies as inputs to the instrument.

Construction: The instrument was used to answer the research objectives related to the level of competencies of EPP teachers and their competency needs in teaching specialization courses of EPP. The questionnaire consisted of three parts. The first part focuses on the personal and professional characteristics of EPP teachers, including age, sex, are of specialization, number of years in teaching, highest educational attainment, seminars and trainings attended, and number of completed and presented researches. The second part includes the level of competencies along the four areas: home economics, agri-fishery arts, information, and communications technology and industrial arts. The last part involves the competencies of EPP teachers.

Validation: Experts in the field of research were requested to evaluate, in independent rounds, if the questionnaire has theory, construction or content validity. The results of the validation were incorporated in the final design of the instrument.

Also, a reliability test was conducted to ensure the reliability of the instrument. Cronbach's alpha was used for this purpose. Results of the test showed high reliability and internal consistency with values ranging from 0.8102 to 0.9841 which meant good to excellent reliability and consistency.

Administration: Necessary permits were acquired by the researcher in order to distribute the questionnaires, as well as to conduct interviews and Focus Group Discussion. Permits were secured from various offices in order to follow the protocols of research and instrument distribution in DepEd Batangas. The respondents were asked to answer the questionnaire after permission was granted. The responses were kept confidential; Data Privacy Act was also strictly followed in the use of information given by the respondents. The respondents were also guided in cases where they need additional explanations related to the items given in the questionnaire.

A week was given to the respondents in order for them to analyze the items carefully. Follow-ups were made as necessary, while still ensuring that no pressure was given to the respondents. After the allotted time, retrieval was done ensuring 100% retrieval rate.

Scoring of Responses: A four-point scale was used to score responses to the questionnaire items. The range and verbal interpretations are as follow:

Point Value	Statistical Limit	Descriptive Equivalent
4	3.50 - 4.00	Greatly Manifested/Very Competent
3	2.50 - 3.49	Moderately Manifested/Moderately Competent
2	1.50 - 2.49	Slightly Manifested/ Slightly Competent
1	1.00 - 1.49	Least Manifested/Least Competent

Interview. Unstructured interview was conducted to add necessary information to the data obtained from the questionnaire. There were five questions answered by teachers and heads to assess the level of competencies of EPP teachers in order to identify the competency needs in teaching specialization courses. The interviews were done after the retrieval of the questionnaires. A total of 55 teachers were interviewed, and their responses were recorded and provided support to the quantitative data.

Focus Group Discussion. This was conducted among the respondents to verify the responses obtained from the research instrument. Selected public secondary EPP teachers were invited to serve as discussants on matters regarding the level of competencies of EPP teachers, and the competency needs in teaching specialization courses of EPP. The FGD agenda were developed to facilitate the flow of group discussion. EPP teachers had insightful conversations regarding the issues and concerns in EPP instruction.

Assessing the level of competencies of EPP teachers in teaching specialization courses was at the core of the discussion. Issues and concerns regarding the attainment of learner's National Certificate I and II were also discussed. The group shared some of the issues and concerns in their respective schools, as well as the responsibilities that they undertake.

Prior to any data gathering activity, an initial permit from the Schools Division Superintendent was solicited. Afterwards, the researcher asked permission from the principals of the target schools. Upon securing the necessary permission, the researcher started to distribute the questionnaire to the respondents. The distribution of questionnaires was done according to the date and time agreed by the researcher and the administrators. The data gathered were tabulated for statistical treatment.

The interview was done through a face-to-face encounter to solicit new ideas from the interviewees using guidelines to ensure that the same general ideas were generated. The questions were prepared beforehand, and all the responses were recorded. The interviews were done in separate instances. On the other hand, the Focus Group Discussion was done at a predetermined time and place. The discussions were facilitated by the researcher and the ideas were recorded to ensure complete capturing of ideas. The topics for discussion were prepared before the FGD and the discussants were made aware of the objectives of the study, as well as the recording of the discussion to verify gathered information.

Tools for Data Analysis

The data gathered were tabulated, analyzed, and interpreted using the following statistical tools:

Frequency Count. This was used to determine the distribution of responses in terms of personal and professional characteristics with their corresponding categories for each profile.

Percentage. This was used to determine the weight of certain profile variables to the totality of the responses.

Weighted Mean. This was used to measure the degree or level of responses in each item.

Chi-Square Test. This was used to test the relationship between the personal and professional characteristics of EPP teachers and their profile variables.

RESULTS AND DISCUSSION

This chapter deals with the presentation, analysis and interpretation of the data gathered relative to sub-problems in the study.

This study assessed the level of competency of EPP teachers relative to their instructional performance. Likewise, it described the personal and professional characteristics of EPP teachers and determined the competencies along the four areas of EPP: Home Economics, Industrial Arts, Information and Communications Technology and Agriculture.

It also measured the level of competencies of EPP teachers in terms of knowledge of content within and across curriculum teaching areas, strategies and methods, classroom management, integration of ICT, and assessment and evaluation. Furthermore, it tested whether there was a significant relationship in the level of competencies of EPP teachers and their profile variables.

The study utilized the descriptive research design, with a researcher-made questionnaire as primary data gathering instrument. Quantitative results are supported by interview and focus group discussion. A total of 284 EPP teachers served as respondents.

After a careful and thorough analysis of the gathered data, this study yielded these salient findings:

1. Profile of the EPP Teachers

The profile of EPP teachers in terms of age, sex, specialization, years in teaching, highest educational attainment, seminars attended, and research productivity was determined in this study.

1.1. Age. Majority of the respondents are 36 years old or older, comprising 58.45% of the EPP teachers. Only 24.65% are 26-35 years old, while those who are 25 years old or younger comprise 16.9% of the population.

1.2. Sex. A great majority of the respondents (246 or 86.62%) are female while only 38 or 13.38% are male teachers, showing how female teachers greatly outnumber their male counterparts.

1.3. Area of specialization. There are 186 Home Economics majors, 42 Industrial Arts majors and 38 Information and Communications Technology, and 18 Agri-Fishery Arts majors among the respondents.

1.4. Number of years teaching. In terms of length of service, 141 respondents have served for less than 10 years, 85 respondents have served for 10 to 19 years already, and 58 respondents have served for 20 years or more. This shows that the majority of EPP teachers in Batangas are still relatively young in the field.

1.5. Highest Educational Attainment. Out of the 284 respondents, 172 have finished their Baccalaureate degree and 112 respondents have advanced degrees. Advanced degrees include those with Masters' and Doctorate Degrees showing that very few EPP teachers have engaged in post-graduate studies.

1.6. Seminars and Training attended. Majority of the respondents or 55.99% have attended six to eight seminars while 29.58% have attended less than five seminars. There were also only 41 respondents or 14.44% who claimed to be very active in participating in seminars and trainings as they have attended nine or more seminars.

1.7. Number of Completed and Presented Researches. Majority or 187 of the respondents (65-85) have presented at most one research. There are 97 respondents (34.15%) have experienced presenting research work twice or more.

2. Respondents' Level of Competencies on the Four Areas of EPP

The EPP teachers' level of competencies in Home Economics, Industrial Arts, Agri-Fishery Arts and Information and Communications Technology was assessed in this study.

2.1. Home Economics. Competencies relative to Home Economics are greatly manifested by the respondents. Further analysis revealed that respondents show great manifestations in terms of improving attitudes toward home economics which got the highest mean value.

2.2. Industrial Arts. Competencies related to Industrial Arts are also greatly manifested by teachers. The analysis showed that the respondents greatly manifest practices on basic housekeeping procedures, observation of safety precaution in doing work, reading and following instructions before using any equipment.

2.3. Agriculture. Competencies related to Agriculture arts are moderately manifested by the respondents. Specifically, they observe the 5C's principle in their work area, determine areas of concern for safety measures, and apply appropriate safety measures in the workplace.

2.4. Information and Communications Technology.

Competencies relative to Information and Communications Technology are moderately manifested by the respondents. Generally, teachers use computers to collect and communicate information to students, colleagues, and parents.

3. Competencies of EPP teachers

The study also assessed the competencies of EPP teachers along five areas.

3.1. Knowledge of content within and across curriculum teaching areas. EPP teachers were found to be very competent in terms of knowledge of content within and across curriculum teaching areas. Having the highest assessment was their skills in motivating learners to create and establish connections between topics.

3.2. Strategies and Methods. In terms of strategies and methods, it was revealed that the respondents are very competent, especially in encouraging students to articulate thoughts and ideas clearly and effectively.

3.3. Classroom Management. The data revealed that the respondents are very competent when it comes to maintaining a safe and orderly classroom that facilitates student learning, as well as in managing student behavior positively through effective communication to defuse and deescalate disruptive or dangerous behavior.

3.4. Integration of ICT. The analysis showed that the respondents are very competent in terms of ICT integration. It was seen that they integrate technology into their instruction to maximize student learning.

3.5. Assessment and Evaluation. In terms of assessment, the respondents were found to be very competent, especially in monitoring student progress toward instructional goals, and reporting assessment results for school-level analysis, evaluation, and decision-making.

4. Relationship in the level of Competencies of EPP teachers and their Profile Variables

There is no significant relationship between the respondents' age and sex. The level of competencies on knowledge of content within and across curriculum teaching areas, strategies and methods, classroom management, integration of ICT, and evaluation and assessment. There is significant relationship between their area of specialization and strategies and method, classroom management, integration of ICT, and evaluation and assessment.

Similarly, significant relationships are established between respondents' number of years of teaching experience and their knowledge of content within and across curriculum teaching areas, strategies and methods, classroom management, integration of ICT, and evaluation and assessment. However, there are no significant relationship between the respondents' highest educational attainment and their knowledge of content within and across curriculum teaching areas, strategies and methods, classroom management.

Significant relationship was seen between the teachers' highest educational attainment and their integration of ICT. Significant relationship were also observed between the number of seminars and training attended and their strategies and methods, classroom management, integration of ICT, and evaluation and assessment.

Lastly, there was a significant relationship between the respondents' number of completed and presented researches and their knowledge of content within and across curriculum teaching areas, classroom management, integration of ICT and evaluation and assessment.

5. Competency needs of EPP Teachers.

Analysis yielded that there is a need to strengthen the teachers' skills in applying a range of teaching strategies through LAC sessions. Teachers also need to attend different EPP-focused seminars and training to develop competencies in teaching EPP. Improving EPP teachers' ICT skills to address learning goals for daily lesson integration was also found to be a need among teachers.

There was also a need in terms of engaging faculty members in collegial coaching to brainstorm on best teaching methodologies, supporting EPP teachers by transforming weak areas into strengths through technical assistance, and equipping laboratory rooms with complete tools, equipment and paraphernalia for each course offered.

6. Competency Management Program for EPP Teachers

As a result of the key findings, the researcher proposed a competency management program specifically for EPP teachers. This program has three major activities, all geared towards the enhancement of competencies of EPP teachers. The program is designed for EPP teachers in Batangas, and focuses on improving their capacities on research, ICT integration, and participation in professional development activities.

This below tables presents the data gathered in the study.

Recommendations

Based on the findings and the conclusions drawn, the following recommendations are offered by the researcher:

1. The EPP teachers and the school administrators should have a goal-oriented action in attaining proficiency through integrative and collaborative activities as part of the competency management program.
2. The EPP teachers and the school administrators should inclusively create equal opportunities for everyone to tap their knowledge bases and resources.
3. The proposed competency management program may be tried out to test the usefulness of its implementation.
4. Similar researches in other learning areas may be done to further validate and strengthen the findings of this study.

REFERENCES

- Bauzon, Prisciliano (2012). Fundamental philosophies of education. National Book Store.
- Bayocot A. (2014). Philippine Public School Teachers Association country report Philippines. Topic: Balancing the teaching activities in the classroom with crucial professional upgrading activities for teachers. The 30th ASEAN Council of Teachers Convention, Singapore.
- Blanchard and Thacker (2004) Blanchard, P. N., & Thacker, J. W. (2004). Effective training: Systems, strategies, and practices (2nd Ed.). Upper Saddle River, NJ: Person Education, Inc.
- Cucoş, C. (2013). Educația- experiențe, reflecții, soluții, Editura Polirom, Iași.
- Daling-Hammond, L. (2016). Powerful teacher education: Lessons from exemplary programs. San Francisco, CA: Jossey-Bass.
- Danielson, C. (2007). Enhancing professional practice, a framework for teaching. USA: Association for Supervision and Curriculum Development (ASCD).
- Freedman, L. (2013). Strategy: A History. Oxford University Press, USA.
- Goldstein, D. (2015). The teacher wars: A history of America's most embattled profession. New York, NY: Anchor Books.
- Rothaermel, F. T. (2012). Strategic Management: Concepts and Cases. McGraw-Hill/Irwin, p. 5.
- Schwalbe, K. and Furlong, D. (2013). Healthcare Project Management. Minnesota: Schwalbe Publishing.
- Stronge, J. H. (2018). Qualities of effective teachers. Alexandria, VA.: ASCD.
- Tripp, D. (2012). Critical Incidents in Teaching: Developing Professional Judgement, Routledge Education Classic Editions, New York.
- Whitaker, T. (2013). What great teachers do differently: 17 things that matter most. New York, NY: Routledge.
- Buabeng-Andoh, C. (2012). An exploration of teachers' skills, perceptions and practices of ICT in teaching and learning in the Ghanaian secondcycle schools. Contemporary Educational Technology.
- De Alca, J. (2008). Factors related to the Performance of Secondary Students in Technology Livelihood Education.
- Gay, M.J. (2012). Excellent Teaching: A Collective Case Study of Outstanding Elementary Mathematics Teachers' Teaching of Mathematics. (Doctoral Dissertation). University of Nebraska, Lincoln, NE: ProQuest Dissertations and Theses.
- Gregorio, M. (2016). Technology and Livelihood (TLE) Instruction of Technical Vocational and Selected General Secondary Schools in Catanduanes. International Journal of Learning, Teaching and Educational Research, Vol. 15, No.4, pp. 69-74
- Gu Saw Lu. (2014). The Relationships Between Instructional Leadership Behavior, School Climate and Teacher Efficacy in Secondary Schools in Kedah. Thesis Doctor of Philosophy, Northern University of Malaysia.
- Goe, L., Bell, C., and Little, O. (2008). Approaches to evaluating teacher effectiveness: A research synthesis. National Comprehensive Center for Teacher Quality. USA: Washington.
- Leger, K. E. (2014). Defining teaching excellence: A phenomenological study of 2013 highly effective louisiana value-added model teachers with perfect evaluation scores. (Unpublished doctoral dissertation). Faculty of the College of Graduate Studies, Lamar University.
- Losee, C. R. (2014). Characteristics of highly effective, veteran middle school teachers (Unpublished doctoral dissertation). Dowling College, School of Education, New York.
- Moran, C. (2005). Teacher and principal perceptions of dispositional characteristics needed by middle school teachers to be most effective in the classroom. (Unpublished doctoral dissertation). Indiana State University, Indiana.
- Ojales, Wilson T. (2009) Proposed Instructional Management Plan for Public Secondary Principals of the Division of Batangas. (Unpublished Dissertation, Batangas State university)

Research Through Innovation